

West Hillhurst Planning Committee Meeting Minutes

April 15, 2024 7:00pm Zoom Meeting

Attendance

Chairperson: Interim Chair Ken Hersen
Coordinator: Karen Dahl
Members present: Wayne Newby, Deb Kowbel, Janice Paskey, Leigha Pidde
Guests present: Ashly Black, Heather Hansen, Leah Thorpe, Chris Lalchan, Leah Phillips, Carole Elliot

1. 7:00pm LOC2024-0077: 2328 1 Ave NW, Land Use Amendment to accommodate H-GO from R-C2

DP2024-01804: 2328 1 AV NW, New: Dwelling Units (2 buildings), Secondary Suites (7 suites), Accessory Residential Building (garage, mobility storage lockers - 4, bicycle lockers - 3)

Comments Re: LOC2024-0077/DP2024-01804 – 2328 1 Avenue NW:

The West Hillhurst Planning Committee (WHPC) respectfully submits the following comments concerning the above referenced Land Use Change to the Housing Grade-Oriented (H-GO):

The WHPC supports the City's strategy to provide more housing options within the city and is interested in seeing how the rezoning will help to provide more affordable housing and address the missing middle housing (3 bedroom dwellings) within the West Hillhurst area. However, the WHPC has concerns relating to the lack of a final Riley LAP. The WHPC is of the position that the best development outcomes come from a broadly participated planning process such as the Riley Communities LAP. We are not calling for a halt to (re)development, only a temporary halt to land use amendments until the current LAP process is completed. Landowners do not have a right to land use amendment, only a right to a reasonable use of their property, which they have under the current land use zoning.

The WHPC acknowledges that community concerns regarding increased traffic, density, height, shadow effects, waste and safety are typically within the scope of the development permit applications. However, the unique characteristics of this land use amendment and significant community concern, necessitates that these items be evaluated as part of this land use amendment. Should this land use amendment be accepted, the scope of the development would only be restricted by existing zoning by-laws which in this case would be insufficient and too broad to adequately address the numerous community's concerns that exist with these aspects of the development.

The WHPC expects the development to be built with high quality materials such as brick or stone. Recent row housing infills in the West Hillhurst neighbourhood have been constructed with low-quality materials and have clear signs of premature degradation.

Information regarding the environmental impact, or sustainability, of continued densification is required prior to approval. Increasing on-street parking congestion, reducing (or eliminating) private amenity space, failing to protect the existing tree canopy and other natural assets, increasing impervious surfaces with negative impacts to runoff and water quality, and general

over-development is of particular concern to the WHPC. The focus on density fails to consider the climate emergency facing the City of Calgary.

This Land Use Amendment requires primary transit. West Hillhurst does not have primary transit. We do not believe listing it on a map respects the intent of the requirement.

- The Primary Transit Network as outlined in the Calgary Transportation Plan indicates service better than 10 minute frequency – there is a clear disconnect between the transportation policy, land use policy and Calgary Transit’s scheduling.
- We note that West Hillhurst does not currently have any transit routes (including the newly revised Route 1 as of Fall 2023) that satisfy the City’s own definition of “Primary Transit”. In the 2020 Calgary Transportation Plan, this is defined as i) <10min frequency ii) 15 hrs a day iii) 7 days a week. Winter 2023 Route 1 schedules only provide 16m frequency in the AM and PM peak.
- West Hillhurst does not have a BRT Route such as Route 305 BRT service as providing Primary Transit to West Hillhurst. This route was discontinued in Fall of 2023. As background, this route was always incorrectly classified as “BRT” service - its name a relic from 2018 when it was replaced by the MAX Orange Route on 16th Ave. Previously, Route 305 ran 3 buses during the AM & PM rush hours periods respectively, on a 30-minute frequency. This was more properly classified as “express bus” service.

Note: Re Transit Supportive Development

- Our reading of the referenced bylaw does not indicate that a ‘Transit Supportive development’ reduction and ‘Bicycle supportive development’ reduction can be applied concurrently. Both reductions refer to the baseline required parking requirement, not an adjusted or final parking requirement. In applying both reductions concurrently, the total reduction is 50% of the required parking which is not permitted under either reduction method. Our interpretation of section 1354 is that bicycle reduction cannot be used to increase parking reduction beyond 25% of baseline requirement.
<https://www.calgary.ca/planning/land-use/online-land-use-bylaw.html?part=14&div=1> (see sections 1350, 1352 and 1354)

WHPC has a number of questions and statements based on the Development Permit. The committee has categorized them as follows:

1. The density being proposed is too aggressive for this established street and exceeds the definition of low density housing in Bylaw 1P2007 section 1386(a). Furthermore, the developer has misrepresented stacked units as one unit with a basement suite for both dwellings. As it is presented, this development is 130 units per hectare
2. In accordance with the Community Standards Bylaw 32M2023, section 42, all addresses shall be visible from the street or the alley if the unit is facing the alley. The second building is not facing the street or lane.
3. The WHPC requests confirmation that the area coverage is less than 60%, our calculations show 65%.
4. The committee is concerned with the seven carports proposed and the theft and safety issues that carports create.

5. 23 Street is a “snow route” and during the parking ban street parking will not be available.
6. The amenity space is insufficient and not in accordance with Bylaw 1P2007 which requires passive or active use space. The courtyard which is intended to have trees and shrubs cannot be counted as amenity space.
7. There does not appear to be enough space to shovel the snow from walkways, while keeping it within the property boundaries in accordance with the City of Calgary Street Bylaw (20M88) section 67.
8. In accordance with the Community Standards Bylaw 32M2023, section 35, storm runoff cannot drain into adjacent properties. The second building in the development does not have a permeable surface where storm drainage can be directed to.
9. There does not appear to be sufficient space for garbage, compost and recycling. This causes congestion within the laneway, for not only this development but all neighbouring garages. We propose Molok waste and recycling bins and the hiring of a private company removal.
10. Tree schedule shows many lilacs being proposed, although a hearty plant, these trees require maintenance. The other proposed trees (Swedish Aspen and Columnar Spruce) are to be planted between the two buildings. Swedish Aspen trees require direct sunlight and also require 8 to 10 ft diameter for root spread. These trees will affect sidewalks and building foundations and are incorrect for the space.
11. The neighbour to the west of the development has a very mature pine tree on the property line between the two properties. Care must be taken to protect that tree and tree’s roots from damage during construction.
12. The WHPC expects assurances from the builder that the tree bylaw and sidewalk remediation will be followed.
13. There are errors on the drawings which cause concern. The “north arrows” are wrong and the lane is paved (not gravel).
14. This type of development is not inclusive and excludes use by seniors and persons with mobility issues.
15. The schools in the community are at their maximum enrollment. We are concerned with the lack of thoughtful infrastructure support with the increase in density our community is experiencing.
16. The future of Louise Dean School is not known. However, the community uses this green space, soccer field, baseball diamonds, playground and basketball courts.
17. We request the developer to resubmit the Development Permit to address our concerns.

2. 8:00pm Development Permit Applications:

LOC2023-0244: 405, 407, 411, 415 19 St NW, Land Use Amendment to accommodate H-GO

This LOC was originally circulated in September 2023. It has been re-circulated with a “What we heard” report. We resubmitted our original comments with some adjustments.

Comments re. LOC2023 – 0244: 405, 407, 411, 415 19th Street NW

The West Hillhurst Planning Committee (WHPC) respectfully submits the following comments concerning the above referenced Land Use Change to the Housing Grade-Oriented (H-GO) designation:

- The WHPC supports the City’s strategy to provide more housing options within the City and is interested in seeing affordable housing and missing middle housing opportunities within the West Hillhurst area, including 19th Street. However, the WHPC has concerns relating to the lack of a final Riley LAP. The WHPC is of the position that the best development outcomes come from a broadly participated planning process such as the Riley Communities LAP. We are not calling for a halt to (re)development, only a temporary halt to land use amendments until the current LAP process is completed. Landowners do not have a right to land use amendment, only a right to a reasonable use of their property, which they have under the current land use zoning.
- In order for stakeholders to be in the best possible position to evaluate the merits of this application, the WHPC encourages the applicant to submit a development permit application so the land use redesignation and DP can be evaluated on a concurrent basis.
- The unit density per hectare is calculated at 180, which far exceeds the scale of the low residential housing. This density scale is equivalent to a multi storey apartment building. The developer shall provide a design that adheres to the Land use Bylaw 1P2007 section 529 where it indicates maximum number density of parcels for R-CG is 75 units per hectare. The H-GO Land use Bylaw 1P2007 section 1386(a) states “grade-oriented development in a range of housing.....at a scale that is consistent with low density residential districts (as described in part 5).”
- The WHPC acknowledges that community concerns regarding increased traffic, density, height, shadow effects, waste and safety are typically within the scope of the development permit applications. However, the unique characteristics of this land use amendment and significant community concern, necessitates that these items be evaluated as part of this land use amendment. Should this land use amendment be accepted, the scope of the development would only be restricted by existing zoning by-laws which in this case would be insufficient and too broad to adequately address the numerous community’s concerns that exist with these aspects of the development.
- This parcel is not within the distances noted in article 1386 of the Land Use Bylaw, which is a clear indication that H-GO is not justified at this location. The parcel is over 200m from Kensington and is not within 400m of a BRT station. The Bylaw does not stipulate that the proposed parcels be approximately 200m from a Mainstreet (as identified by CivicWorks (see page 3)), it is to be within 200m. The WHPC has repeatedly explained the incorrect classification of BRT service within this neighborhood. The reality is 19th

Street at this location is not proximate to frequent transit service and is not within 400m of a BRT service. It is extremely frustrating to have to repeat this comment every time a new up-zone application comes to the planning committee. CivicWorks should be aware of this mistake by now, as should the City, and proximity to a non-existent BRT station should not be used as justification for H-GO at this location. For clarity, the WHPC will repeat its comments concerning BRT and primary transit routes:

- o Route 305 is incorrectly classified as “BRT” service - its name a relic from 2018 when it was replaced by the MAX Orange Route on 16th Ave. Currently Route 305 only runs 3 buses during the AM & PM rush hours periods respectively, on a 30 minute frequency. This is more properly classified as “express bus” service.
 - o Given this limited frequency, neither the Route 305 or any other routes serving West Hillhurst meet the City’s own definition of “Primary Transit”. In the 2020 Calgary Transportation Plan, this is defined as i) <10min frequency ii) 15 hrs a day and ii) 7 days a week.
- The WHPC is concerned with the planned covered carport with supposed space for 18 motor vehicles. First, the length of the combined parcels, along with the waste facilities, does not seem adequate for the number of vehicles. Second, there are crime concerns over covered parking at the lane and the WHPC points the City to its own Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) program. Unsecured parking in a rear alley raises significant concerns around safety. The lack of space for secured parking suggests that this development is simply too large for the parcel. Thirdly, the rear alley has a number of power poles which will impact access to these parking stalls.
 - The WHPC is concerned that the indicated waste and recycling receptacles is inadequate for the number of dwellings. In accordance with Land use Bylaw 1P2007 section 546.3, the Development Authority must approve the Waste, Recycling and Organics Plan. Land use Bylaw section 504 also requires recycling facilities for townhouse or row house units. The WHPC expects the development plans will include a design approved by the authority plan which also shows the basis of collection volume.
 - The increase to vehicular traffic generated by the proposed development would pose a substantial increase in hazards to pedestrians and cyclists. This is in direct violation of multiple city policies that place pedestrians and cyclists at the top of the mobility hierarchy.
 - The WHPC acknowledges increasing concerns with issues arising from Airbnb rentals within the community. Although the regulation of such activities is outside the scope of this application, the committee would like to see increased emphasis on properties suitable for long-term rather than short-term occupation.
 - There is increased concern regarding this buildform within the community as the existing row house located at 701 19 Street NW is repeatedly in violation of noise, nuisance and litter complaints.
 - The WHPC expects the development to be built with high quality materials such as brick or stone. Recent row housing infills in the West Hillhurst neighborhood have been constructed with low-quality materials and have clear signs of premature degradation.

- The WHPC expects assurances from the builder that the tree bylaw and sidewalk remediation will be followed. Although conceptual, the current rendering shows 14 trees. This development requires one tree and three shrubs per 110 m² parcel, so in total, 18 trees and 54 shrubs. The tree schedule shall indicate trees appropriate for the space to ensure proper growing conditions and avoid damage to the dwellings from root spread.
- The amenity space, although conceptual, does not appear to be adequate. The WHPC suggests that similar to Land Use Bylaw section 615 (b), that the minimum amenity space per dwelling of 7.5 m² unit be provided in the form of common space, balconies and/or patios.
- At present, the conceptual plan The WHPC expects an adequate area be designated or available to contain snow volume within the property as designated in Street Bylaw section 64. The conceptual drawings do not appear to have this space.
- The community has spent four years working on 19St. Streetscape through three rounds of consultations. All engagements point to wider sidewalks and a pleasant pedestrian experience. We argue against reduced setbacks or any design that would limit sidewalk expansion. We also argue a pleasant pedestrian experience involves maintaining the current established trees on site.
- The WHPC is concerned with the impact this type of redesignation will have on the ongoing work and focus on mobility and streetscaping on 19th Street. The roadway is narrow at this location and developments with small setbacks prevent the area from realizing plans for wider sidewalks and cycling lanes.
- While CivicWorks comments on examples of nearby multi-unit developments to support the “future development vision to complement the scale of surrounding area development”, the WHPC reminds the city that the four parcels making up this proposed development are sandwiched between two single family homes on either end of the block. The WHPC questions whether this will complement the scale of the surrounding homes.
- Rear alleys in West Hillhurst are heavily impacted by the significant increase in the number of garbage, recycling and compost bins from new density focused developments. While the WHPC notes the use of commercial garbage and recycling in the proposed plans, the available spaces allocated for this purpose appears insufficient, given that there will be 36 units within this development and parking for 18 vehicles on the alley. As noted above, the presence of power poles in the narrow alley suggests that commercial garbage collection must be well planned and located.
- Information regarding the environmental impact, or sustainability, of continued densification is required prior to approval. Increasing on-street parking congestion, reducing (or eliminating) private amenity space, failing to protect the existing tree canopy and other natural assets, increasing impervious surfaces with negative impacts to runoff and water quality, and general over-development is of particular concern to the WHPC. The focus on density fails to consider the climate emergency facing the City of Calgary.

DP2024-01980: 2524 7 Ave NW, New: Semi-detached Dwelling

- The committee would like to see the applicant pursue revised design options which could make the build form less imposing and more welcoming to the broader community
- The committee is concerned over the lack of landscaping on the site and would like to see a tree canopy to enhance the streetscape.
- The applicant should consider water drainage issues that the front cement patio may create.

New developments are required to plant trees to enhance our neighbourhood's urban canopy. We expect the tree schedule to be followed and monitored as per the City's tree requirements for new homes bylaw:

<https://www.calgary.ca/development/home-building/new-home-trees.html>

- Please see the attached letter regarding treeless homes in West Hillhurst.

DP2024-02017: 224 18A St NW, New: Single Detached Dwelling (south parcel), Accessory Residential Building (garage)

- To ensure the final build is not over allowable height, it is recommended the builder does not design to maximum height.
- The applicant should ensure that privacy concerns are mitigated by using frosted glass on the rooftop patios.
- We expect the applicant to ensure lot coverage bylaws are adhered to.
- The committee would like clarification on the proposed ground bump outs. To our knowledge, bump outs are only permitted on the second storey.
- New developments are required to plant trees to enhance our neighbourhood's urban canopy. We expect the tree schedule to be followed and monitored as per the City's tree requirements for new homes bylaw:

<https://www.calgary.ca/development/home-building/new-home-trees.html>

- Please see the attached letter regarding treeless homes in West Hillhurst.

DP2024-02018: 224 18A ST NW, New: Single Detached Dwelling (north parcel), Accessory Residential Building (garage)

- To ensure the final build is not over allowable height, it is recommended the builder does not design to maximum height.
- The applicant should ensure that privacy concerns are mitigated by using frosted glass on the rooftop patios.
- We expect the applicant to ensure lot coverage bylaws are adhered to.
- The committee would like clarification on the proposed ground bump outs. To our knowledge, bump outs are only permitted on the second storey.
- New developments are required to plant trees to enhance our neighbourhood's urban canopy. We expect the tree schedule to be followed and monitored as per the City's tree requirements for new homes bylaw:

<https://www.calgary.ca/development/home-building/new-home-trees.html>

- Please see the attached letter regarding treeless homes in West Hillhurst.

3. 8:15pm Other Items:

- Approve March 18, 2024 Meeting Minutes
- Transportation Committee Update
 - Crossing concerns at Lions Senior Village
 - Bethany parking
 - Crossing concerns at 19 Street 5 and 6 Ave
- New Business

Adjourned 9:00pm